# California MLPA Master Plan Science Advisory Team for the MLPA South Coast Study Region December 17, 2008 Meeting Summary (revised January 12, 2009)

Wednesday, December 17, 2008 9:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.

Sheraton Gateway Los Angeles Hotel
6101 West Century Boulevard
Los Angeles, CA 90045
and via simultaneous webcast on the MLPA website

Note: Audio and video recordings of this meeting are available on the Internet at http://www.dfg.ca.gov/mlpa/. Please contact AGP Video Services at (805) 772-2715 to obtain DVD copies of these recordings.

**SAT members attending:** Larry Allen, Richard Ambrose, Eric Bjorkstedt, Mark Carr, Susan Chivers, Chris Costello, Paul Dayton, Kevin Fleming, Dominic Gregorio, Ray Hilborn, Steven Morgan, Steve Murray, Dan Pondella, Pete Raimondi, Dan Robinette, Astrid Scholz, Stephen Stohs, Stephen Weisberg, and Steve Wertz.

**SAT members absent:** Steve Gaines and John Largier.

# **Meeting Objectives**

- Review and potentially adopt marine protected area (MPA) evaluation methods for the MLPA South Coast Study Region
- Review and discuss habitat quality guidance
- Review and potentially adopt revisions to criteria for the list of species likely to benefit from MPAs for the MLPA South Coast Study Region
- Assign work groups to address science questions from the MLPA South Coast Regional Stakeholder Group (SCRSG)
- Review and provide feedback on proposed science presentations to the SCRSG and MLPA Blue Ribbon Task Force

The meeting agenda may be found on the MLPA website at http://www.dfg.ca.gov/mlpa/meetings\_sc.asp

# **Executive Summary**

The fourth meeting of the South Coast Study Region Science Advisory team took place at the Sheraton Gateway Los Angeles Hotel on December 17, 2008. SAT members approved the following:

- Methods for evaluating habitat representation
- Delineation of five bioregions in the South Coast Study Region
- The current approach to identifying unique habitats
- The criteria for populating the species likely to benefit list
- Three science presentations to be given to the Regional Stakeholder Group

# **Meeting Summary**

# Welcome, Introductions and Review of Agenda

On December 17, 2008, the fourth meeting of the MLPA Master Plan Science Advisory Team (SAT) for the South Coast Study Region (SCSR) was held in Los Angeles.

# I. Updates

#### A. SAT calendar

The next SAT meeting will take place over two days; a conference call on January 23 will be followed by a meeting in Los Angeles on January 27. Future meeting dates are February 24, April 1 & 3, May 5, June 18, and October 6, 2009.

# B. Update on joint meeting of the California Fish and Game Commission and MLPA Blue Ribbon Task Force

The California Fish and Game Commission requested that the existing northern Channel Islands MPA network be left intact and included in the SAT evaluations of proposed MPA arrays in this study region.

#### C. Restored habitats work group

The restored habitats work group is revising the document and incorporating comments from the SAT. Beach manipulation activities were discussed during their own section of this meeting.

# II. MPA Design Guidelines and Evaluation Methods for the MLPA South Coast Study Region

## D. Habitat representation

SAT member Mark Carr presented information about habitat representation, key and unique habitats, and the identification of bioregions in the South Coast Study Region. The SAT voted to approve the current approach to identifying unique habitats, the habitat representation evaluation methods, and the five bioregions discussed at the November 12, 2008 meeting. Additionally, the SAT requested more information from the key and unique habitats work group about where those habitats exist in the study region, how they will be evaluated in MPAs, and how they are affected by extractive activities.

#### E. Size and spacing

SAT member Eric Bjorkstedt and Dr. Dave Siegel showed presentations on the size and spacing guidelines and how they might be applied in the South Coast Study Region. Dr. Siegel presented a physical model of passive transport in the Southern California Bight, and SAT members commented on its usefulness. Members would like to hear more about how models can inform potential changes to the size and spacing guidelines, particularly as they apply to the Channel Islands. The models could potentially help stakeholders understand the oceanography of the study region, and could be used as a supplementary MPA array evaluation method, though the current guidelines will continue to be the primary method of size and spacing evaluation.

# F. Habitat replication

SAT member Pete Raimondi presented information about the habitat replication evaluation methods used in the North Central Coast Study Region and what information might be used to inform the guidelines in the South Coast Study Region. SAT members discussed different available datasets, and would like to receive more information about why habitats have to be a certain size to count in the habitat replication evaluation.

#### G. Levels of Protection

SAT member Larry Allen presented information about the current level of protection framework and how it might apply to selected activities from the South Coast Study Region. SAT members discussed the methodology and agreed that the levels of protection work group should continue assigning levels of protection using the existing framework. The work grouph hopes to present more information about a potential quantitative methodology at the January SAT meeting.

# III. MPA Design Guidelines and Evaluation Methods for the MLPA South Coast Region (continued)

# H. Modeling evaluation tools

SAT member Chris Costello and Dr. Will White presented updates on their respective modeling efforts. The SAT agreed with the current modeling approach and the modeling work group will continue to develop models and incorporate relevant species and oceanography from the South Coast Study Region.

#### I. Birds and mammals

SAT member Susan Chivers presented a methodology for evaluating MPA arrays for bird and mammal impacts. SAT members agreed with the approach and will send comments to the birds and mammals work group for incorporation before the next SAT meeting.

# IV. Habitat Quality

## J. Water quality

SAT member Dominic Gregorio presented the latest draft of the document describing water quality issues in the South Coast Study Region. SAT members discussed the changes and requested more information on some topics, including clarifying the evaluation approach, finalizing the sites of concern, and explaining the rationale behind using a 2km area around

intake pipes. The water quality work group will work towards addressing these topics by the January SAT meeting.

# K. Beach manipulation activities

I-team member Jason Vasques presented a background document on beach manipulation activities in the South Coast Study Region. The habitat quality work group will finalize the document for the January SAT meeting.

# V. Species Likely to Benefit from MPAs

L. Update from the SAT Species Likely to Benefit work group SAT member Rich Ambrose presented the criteria for evaluating species likely to benefit from MPAs.

M. Discuss revisions to criteria to be used to develop list of species likely to benefit SAT members discussed each criterion and voted to approve the criteria list with small amendments. The species likely to benefit work group will use the approved criteria to populate a species spreadsheet with scores and present their findings at the January SAT meeting.

#### VI. Science Questions

#### N. Review science questions

I-team member Jason Vasques presented a list of new questions to the SAT from the Regional Stakeholder Group. Some questions were assigned to staff, while new SAT work groups were formed to address three of the questions.

# VII. Proposed Science Presentations

## O. Oceanography

I-team member Evan Fox gave a presentation on oceanography for SAT member John Largier, who will be the actual presenter. The SAT approved this presentation.

#### P. Birds and mammals

SAT member Dan Robinette gave a presentation on birds and mammals in the South Coast Study Region. The SAT approved this presentation.

#### Q. Water quality

SAT member Dominic Gregorio gave a presentation on water quality issues in the South Coast Study Region. The SAT approved this presentation.

#### **Public Comment**

Members of the public commented on a wide variety of issues at the meeting. Since several votes were taken by the SAT, numerous opportunities arose for public comment. Comments included concerns about sea urchin levels of protection, how the modeling effort will be incorporated into the process, public safety, and protecting natural heritage areas.

Additionally, members of the public suggested sources of data available to the SAT for their consideration and requested better document availability at meetings.

# Next Steps

Approved presentations will be given at the upcoming Regional Stakeholder Group meeting on January 13-14, 2009. SAT work groups will continue working on presentations and guiding documents for approval at their next meeting. The next SAT meeting will be held January 23 and 27, 2009.

# **Briefing Documents**

- A-1: Meetings Schedule for the MLPA South Coast Study Region
- II-1: Draft Summary of Methods Used to Evaluate MPA Proposals in the MLPA South Coast Study Region
- D-1: Key and Unique Habitats in the MLPA South Coast Study Region
- D-2: Map: Divisions between biogeographically relevant bioregions of the MLPA South Coast Study Region
- D-3: Draft analysis of bioregions in the MLPA South Coast Study Region
- D-4: PowerPoint presentation regarding habitat representation
- E-1: PowerPoint presentation: Modeling Larval Connectivity for the Southern California Bight
- E-2: PowerPoint presentation regarding MPA size and spacing
- F-1: PowerPoint presentation regarding habitat replication
- G-1: Draft Levels of Protection for the MLPA South Coast Study Region
- G-2: PowerPoint presentation regarding levels of protection
- H-1: PowerPoint presentation: Spatial bioeconomic models for MPA network design
- I-1: Summary of Guidelines and Evaluation Methods for Marine Birds and Mammals in the MLPA South Coast Study Region
- J-1: Recommendations for Considering Water Quality and Marine Protected Areas in the MLPA South Coast Study Region
- K-1: Draft Background Information Regarding Beach Manipulation Activities in the MLPA South Coast Study Region
- M-1: Draft Criteria for List of Species Likely to Benefit from Marine Protected Areas in the MLPA South Coast Study Region
- N-1: Questions Received at the November 18-19, 2008 MLPA South Coast Regional Stakeholder Group Meeting
- O-1: Draft PowerPoint presentation: Southern California Oceanography, MLPA South Coast Study Region
- P-1: Draft PowerPoint presentation: Marine Birds and Marine Mammals of the MLPA South Coast Study Region
- Q-1: Draft PowerPoint presentation: Water Quality in the MLPA South Coast Study Region