



Final Environmental Impact Report
California Marine Life Protection Act Initiative
North Central Coast Marine Protected Areas Project

State Clearinghouse #2008062028

Prepared for:
California Department of Fish and Game

Prepared by:



July 2009

Final

Environmental Impact Report
California Marine Life Protection Act Initiative
North Central Coast Marine Protected Areas
Project

State Clearinghouse #2008062028

Prepared for:

California Department of Fish and Game
1416 9th Street, Rm 1341-B
Sacramento, CA 95814
Contact: Matt Erickson
707/875-4277

Prepared by:

ICF Jones & Stokes
268 Grand Avenue
Oakland, CA 94610-4724
Contact: Jeff Thomas
510/433-8962

July 2009

ICF Jones & Stokes. 2009. Final Environmental Impact Report: California Marine Life Protection Act Initiative North Central Coast Marine Protected Areas Project. July. State Clearinghouse #2008062028. (ICF J&S 00447.08.) Oakland, CA. Prepared for California Department of Fish and Game, Sacramento, CA.

Contents

| | Page |
|--|------------|
| Figures and Tables | iii |
| Acronyms and Abbreviations | iv |
| Chapter 1. Introduction..... | 1-1 |
| 1.1. CEQA Compliance..... | 1-1 |
| 1.2. Format and Organization of Final Environmental Impact Report..... | 1-1 |
| 1.3. Public Review of Draft Environmental Impact Report..... | 1-2 |
| 1.4. Revisions to Draft Environmental Impact Report..... | 1-2 |
| 1.5. Comments Received on Draft Environmental Impact Report..... | 1-3 |
| 1.6. Preparation of Final Environmental Impact Report..... | 1-4 |
| 1.6.1. Lead Agency | 1-4 |
| 1.6.2. Final EIR Authors | 1-4 |
| Chapter 2. Comments and Responses..... | 2-1 |
| 2.1. Introduction | 2-1 |
| 2.2. Responses to Comments | 2-1 |
| 2.2.1. Master Response 1.0—Improper Implementation of the MLPA..... | 2-2 |
| 2.2.2. Master Response 2.0—Inadequacy of Science Standard | 2-3 |
| 2.2.3. Master Response 3.0—Inadequacy of Socioeconomic Analyses | 2-5 |
| 2.2.4. Master Response 4.0—Failure to Consider Existing Marine Protected Areas..... | 2-5 |
| 2.2.5. Master Response 5.0—Failure to Consider Existing Fishing Management Measures | 2-6 |
| 2.3. Letter A , from Gulf of Farallones National Marine Sanctuary | 2-8 |
| 2.3.1. Responses to Letter A..... | 2-10 |
| 2.4. Letter B , from Allan Jacobs..... | 2-12 |
| 2.4.1. Responses to Letter B..... | 2-21 |
| 2.5. Letter C , from Ocean Conservancy, Natural Resources Defense Council and Defenders of Wildlife..... | 2-28 |
| 2.5.1. Responses to Letter C..... | 2-42 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 2.6. Letter D , from Marine Conservation Biology Institute, California Coastkeeper Alliance, Heal the Bay, Audubon California, The Otter Project, Russian Riverkeeper, National Parks Conservation Association, Golden Gate Audubon Society, Earth Care, San Diego Coastkeeper | 2-50 |
| 2.6.1. Responses to Letter D..... | 2-53 |
| 2.7. Letter E , from Curt Billings | 2-54 |
| 2.7.1. Response to Letter E..... | 2-55 |
| 2.8. Letter F , from Chris Cervellone..... | 2-56 |
| 2.8.1. Response to Letter F..... | 2-57 |
| 2.9. Letter G , from the California State Lands Commission..... | 2-58 |
| 2.9.1. Responses to Letter G | 2-63 |
| 2.10. Letter H , from Environmental Action Committee..... | 2-64 |
| 2.10.1. Responses to Letter H..... | 2-67 |
| 2.11. Letter I , from Chris Grossman..... | 2-68 |
| 2.11.1. Response to Letter I..... | 2-69 |
| 2.12. Letter J , from Paul, Hastings, Janofsky & Walker LLP | 2-70 |
| 2.12.1. Responses to Letter J | 2-81 |
| 2.13. Letter K , from Ralph Kanz | 2-83 |
| 2.13.1. Responses to Letter K..... | 2-89 |
| 2.14. Letter L , from Partnership for Sustainable Oceans..... | 2-94 |
| 2.14.1. Responses to Letter L | 2-107 |
| 2.15. Letter M , from Recreational Fishing Alliance | 2-117 |
| 2.15.1. Responses to Letter M | 2-124 |
| 2.16. Letter N , from U.S. Department of the Interior, Mineral Management Services..... | 2-129 |
| 2.16.1. Responses to Letter N..... | 2-132 |
| 2.17. Letter O , from U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service..... | 2-135 |
| 2.17.1. Responses to Letter O | 2-138 |
| | |
| Chapter 3. Revisions to the Draft Environmental Impact Report | 3-1 |
| 3.1. Introduction | 3-1 |
| 3.2. Changes to Project Description since Issuance of DEIR..... | 3-1 |
| 3.3. Summary of Environmental Effects | 3-1 |
| 3.4. Revisions | 3-2 |
| 3.4.2. Chapter 1—Introduction | 3-2 |
| 3.4.3. Chapter 2—Project Description..... | 3-3 |
| 3.4.4. Chapter 3—Environmental Analysis..... | 3-11 |
| 3.4.5. Chapter 4—Consumptive Uses and Socioeconomic Considerations..... | 3-11 |
| 3.4.6. Chapter 6—Biological Resources | 3-14 |
| 3.4.7. Chapter 7—Social Resources | 3-19 |
| 3.4.8. Appendix C Scoping Report..... | 3-26 |

Figures and Tables

| Figure | Follows Page |
|----------------|--|
| Revised 7.4-1f | Coastal Access and Recreational Use Subregion 6: Farallon Islands 3-22 |
| Revised 7.5-1a | Research, Education and Monitoring Subregion 1: Point Arena to Horseshoe Point 3-25 |
| Revised 7.5-1b | Research, Education and Monitoring Subregion 2: Horseshoe Point to Bodega Head 3-25 |
| Revised 7.5-1c | Research, Education and Monitoring Subregion 3: Bodega Head to Double Point 3-25 |
| Revised 7.5-1d | Research, Education and Monitoring Subregion 4: Double Point to Point San Pedro 3-25 |
| Revised 7.5-1e | Research, Education and Monitoring Subregion 5: Point San Pedro to Pigeon Point..... 3-25 |
| Revised 7.5-1f | Research, Education and Monitoring Subregion 6: Farallon Islands..... 3-25 |
| Table | On Page |
| 2-1 | Commenters on DEIR 2-2 |
| Revised 2-3 | Individual MPAs in Proposed Project..... 3-4 |
| Revised 2-4 | Allowed Take for Individual MPAs in Proposed Project..... 3-5 |
| Revised 2-7 | Special Closures in Proposed Project 3-7 |
| Revised 2-13 | Special Closures in Alternative 1 3-8 |
| Revised 2-19 | Special Closures in Alternative 2..... 3-9 |
| Revised 2-25 | Special Closures in Alternative 3..... 3-10 |
| Revised 7-9 | National Parks Adjacent to the Study Region..... 3-21 |
| Revised 7-12 | Abalone Report Card Landing Sites and Associated 2002–2007 Reported Landings 3-24 |

Acronyms and Abbreviations

| | |
|------------|--|
| ARMP | Abalone Recovery Management Plan |
| B | Beneficial |
| BASI | Best Available Scientific Information |
| BRTF | Blue Ribbon Task Force |
| Caltrans | California Department of Transportation |
| CEQA | California Environmental Quality Act |
| Commission | California Fish and Game Commission |
| CRFS | California Recreational Fisheries Survey |
| DEIR | Draft environmental impact report |
| Department | California Department of Fish and Game |
| FEIR | Final environmental impact report |
| GFNMS | Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary |
| IPA | Integrated Preferred Alternative |
| MBNMS | Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary |
| MLMA | Marine Life Management Act |
| MLPA | California Marine Life Protection Act |
| MMAIA | Marine Managed Area Improvement Act |
| MPAs | Central Coast Marine Protected Areas |
| NCCRSG | North Central Coast Regional Stakeholder Group |
| NI | No impact |
| NMSP | National Marine Sanctuaries Program |
| NOA | Notice of availability |
| SAT | Science Advisory Team |
| SMCA | State Marine Conservation Area |
| SMR | State Marine Reserve |
| SMRMA | State Marine Recreational Management Area |