Overview of Draft Marine Protected Area Proposals

Presentation to the MLPA North Central Coast Regional Stakeholder Group

Evan Fox, Assistant Marine Planner • California MLPA Initiative
February 21, 2008 • San Rafael, CA
Overlap Among Draft Proposals

Geographically similar, but many differences between individual proposed MPAs (especially boundaries, allowed activities)

Quick summary of similarities and differences among proposals
Subregion 1: Point Arena - Horseshoe Point

Subregional Considerations

• Persistent upwelling center; extensive rocky reefs, kelp beds; Garcia and Gualala estuaries; sandy offshore
• Existing MPAs: Manchester and Arena Rock SMCA and Del Mar Landing SMP
• Port of Arena: urchin, salmon, near-shore finfish, D.crab
• Recreational abalone fishery, small boat and shore-fishing
• Importance of recreational and commercial fisheries to local economy
• Tribal uses
• Access points & public/ private lands
Subregion 1: Point Arena to Horseshoe Point
Subregion 1: Draft Proposal Comparison

- Existing MPAs: All proposals would eliminate Manchester SMCA, 3 proposals include Del Mar SMP with only Draft Proposal 4 changing it to SMR
- Point Arena
  - All proposals have SMR/SMCA cluster around Point Arena
  - Proposals 1, 3, 4, external A SMCA: would allow only salmon
  - Proposal 2 SMCA: would allow salmon, crab, anchovy, sardine, herring
- Saunders Reef
  - All 4 internal proposals with 2-SMCA clusters
  - Higher protection MPA proposed offshore in 3 proposals (allow only salmon)
  - Because Proposal 4’s offshore SMCA is closer to shore, it received a lower level of protection of moderate-high
- Sea Ranch/ Salt Point Area
  - Proposals north-south boundaries vary – consideration of access and public/private lands. SMR proposed inshore in all proposals.
  - Proposals 2 and external A have MPA clusters more adjacent to Sea Ranch area, Proposals 1, 3, and 4 are further south of Sea Ranch
Subregion 2: Horseshoe Point - Bodega Head

Subregional Considerations

- Down-current from upwelling center; rocky reefs, kelp beds; numerous seabird and marine mammal colonies; Russian R. estuary
- Existing: Salt Point SMCA, Gerstle Cove SMCA, Fort Ross SMCA, Sonoma Coast SMCA, Bodega SMR
- Port of Bodega Bay: D.crab; salmon; herring; Dover sole / Thornyheads / Sablefish (DTS)
- Recreational abalone, angling (especially Salt Point, Russian River, Sonoma coast area)
Subregion 2: Horseshoe Point to Bodega Head
Existing MPAs: Salt Point SMCA and Gerstle Cove SMCA were replaced, modified or included, depending on proposal. Fort Ross SMCA was eliminated or replaced. Most proposals included some of the Sonoma Coast SMCA area in their Bodega Bay concept; proposal 3 retains a portion of existing MPA. All proposals modified the Bodega SMR to increase in size.

Salt Point/Gerstle Cove
- Proposals 1 and 2: SMP would allow recreational abalone and finfish
- Proposal 3: SMP would allow all recreational take and add mod-high SMCA (would allow salmon & crab) offshore
- Proposal 4: SMP would keep existing regulations
- Proposal 2, 4, and A: Change Gerstle Cove to SMR
- Proposal 1 removes Gerstle Cove, Prop 3 retains existing regulations

Russian River
- Proposal 1, 4, Ext. A: propose SMR at mouth of river up to Hwy 101 bridge
- Proposal 2: mod-low SMCA (would allow take of all species EXCEPT salmon)
- Proposal 3: significantly larger mod-high SMCA (would allow only crab)

Bodega Head
- All proposed inshore SMR/offshore SMCA
- SMCAs: Proposals 1 & 4 (would allow only salmon), Proposal 3 & external A (would allow salmon and crab), Proposal 2 (allow salmon, crab, herring, sardine, and anchovy)
Subregional Considerations

- Highly productive near-shore; retention zone; more limited rocky habitat; numerous estuaries (waterfowl); marine mammal and seabird colonies
- Existing MPAs: Tomales Bay SMP, Point Reyes Headlands SMCA, Estero de Limantour SMCA
- Ports of Bodega (D. crab, salmon, herring, DTS) and Bolinas (D. crab, halibut, salmon, deeper near-shore rockfish)
- Important recreational fishing from Bodega and Bolinas; clamming
- Aquaculture leases - Drakes Estero and Tomales Bay
Subregion 3: Bodega Head to Double Point
Subregion 3: Draft Proposal Comparison

- Existing MPAs: All proposals, except Prop 2, would modify Tomales Bay SMP to a SMR. Point Reyes Headlands SMCA would modify in all proposals to include SMR/SMCA cluster. All proposed enlarging the Estero de Limantour SMCA and most would change it to an SMR.

- Estero Americano and Estero de San Antonio
  - All proposals but 1 and 4 include SMRs (Proposal 1 includes SMRMAs and Proposal 4 proposes no MPAs)

- Tomales Bay
  - Proposal 1, 3, 4, external A: would enlarge existing MPA and propose SMR
  - Proposal 1 and 4: propose SMRMA (no take, but allows duck hunting)

- Point Reyes
  - All had similar MPA cluster (SMR/SMCA), SMR size and boundaries proposed differ to accommodate fishing activities
  - Proposals 1, 3, 4 have mod-high SMCA (salmon and crab only), Proposal 2 & external A would allow salmon, crab, anchovy, sardine, herring, squid

- Drakes Bay/Estero de Limantour
  - All but external A propose SMRs (XA is an SMCA allowing mariculture)
Subregional Considerations

- Influenced by outflow from San Francisco Bay; broad sandy shelf; marine mammal and seabird colonies
- Existing MPAs: Duxbury Reef SMCA
- Ports of San Francisco (D. crab, salmon, halibut, DTS complex) and Bolinas (D. crab, halibut, salmon, deeper near-shore rockfish)
- Recreational vessels from San Francisco ports (e.g., Party boats), small boat angling
Subregion 4:
Double Point to Point San Pedro
Existing MPA: Proposals 1, 3 and 4 proposed to modify or replace Duxbury Reef SMCA. Proposals 2 and external A propose to eliminate.

Duxbury

- Proposals 1 and 4: Three MPAs: inshore SMR, offshore moderate-high SMCA (allow salmon and crab), and an SMCA to the south which would allow salmon, crab, commercial halibut and recreational finfish from shore.
- Proposal 3: Inshore SMR and offshore SMCA (same regulations and boundaries as Proposal 1 and 4) without an additional SMCA to the south.
- Proposals 2 and A: Propose no MPAs in this area
Subregion 5: Point San Pedro - Pigeon Point

Subregional Considerations

- Broad shallow sandy shelf; more limited rocky reef and kelp; seabird and migratory waterfowl areas (Devils Slide, Pescadero)
- Existing MPAs: James V. Fitzgerald SMP
- Port of Half Moon Bay (Pillar Point): D. crab, salmon, halibut, squid
- Recreational shore-based and small boat anglers; party boats from HMB; steelhead (Pescadero)
Subregion 5: Point San Pedro to Pigeon Point
Subregion 5: Draft Proposal Comparison

- Existing MPA: All proposals would modify James V. Fitzgerald SMP with SMR/SMCA cluster

- Fitzgerald
  - Proposal 1: only “stack” configuration; SMCA would allow salmon, crab, wetfish
  - Proposals 2 and external A leaves area to north (San Pedro Point) open; SMCA would allow salmon, crab, anchovy, sardine and herring
  - Proposals 3 and 4: SMCA would allow salmon and crab

- San Gregorio
  - Proposal 4 - only proposal with SMR here

- Pescadero
  - Proposal 3 would include an SMR at Pescadero Estuary
Subregion 6: Farallon Islands

Subregional Considerations

- Shallow/deep rock and sand; unique habitats downstream from upwelling center; globally important for seabirds, mammals, and great white sharks
- Existing MPAs: Farallon Islands SMCA
- Ecotourism (whale watching, seabird and marine mammal watching, etc)
- Accessed by comm. fishing boats from Bolinas, San Francisco, Half Moon Bay (salmon, rockfish, squid)
- Recreational – party boats, private boats (rockfish, salmon, etc)
- Anchoring/safety concerns
Subregion 6: Farallons
Existing MPA: Farallone Islands SMCA was proposed for modification by all proposals.

North Farallon
- No MPA proposed in proposals 2 and external A
- Proposal 1: SMR proposed to state waters in NW quadrant
- Proposal 3: SMR/SMCA to state waters in NW quadrant (moderate-high SMCA allow only salmon)
- Proposal 4: SMR to state waters in the north (same SMR shape as proposal 3)

Southeast Farallon
- All propose SMR around island; Proposal 2 leaves north open
- All propose salmon only SMCA but External Proposal A only moderate-high SMCA because extends into shallow areas

Farallons Islands overall
- Proposal 3: puts remaining area within state waters as moderate-low SMCA (only prohibits sardine, anchovy, squid)
Draft MPAs proposed in similar geographies, but with different regulations and configurations

Guidance from the task force, science team, and CA Department of Fish and Game, and feedback from the public, to inform revisions for third and final round of proposals

Clearly areas of similarity where proposals could converge; areas with differences that may not get resolved and would represent policy choices for task force